The first years of life lay the foundations for an individual’s future skills development and learning. As the Starting Strong reports of the Organisation for Economic Development and Co-operation (OECD) and other research has demonstrated, investments in high-quality early childhood education and care pay dividends in terms of children’s short- and long-term learning and development.

Many OECD countries recognise this and have increased public spending on ECEC, particularly to expand its access. In consequence, universal or quasi-universal access to at least one year of pre-primary education is now a reality in most countries, which constitutes significant progress towards the Sustainable Development Goals education targets. A growing body of research suggests that only high-quality early childhood education and care is associated with children’s development and learning, with especially strong evidence in the case of disadvantaged children. But raising quality can be a daunting task when public budgets are being tightened.

As a result, policy makers face complex decisions in spending, evaluating trade-offs between structural investments and investments that improve the quality of the interactions taking place in early childhood settings, for instance between staff and children. The nature of these demands imply that policy makers need to be informed of the evidence base and then examine how a variety of policy options apply to their context or jurisdiction.

This research report summarises the key findings from two background studies which were commissioned as part of initial desk-based research for the new OECD project “Policy Review: Quality beyond Regulations in Early Childhood Education and Care (ECEC)”, focusing in particular on “process quality”, to be conducted in 2017-2020. The report aims at supporting readers to understand different dimensions of quality in ECEC and the complexity of the provision of education and care for the early years. It also highlights significant quality issues in existing research and avenues for further research.

One of the two background studies is a literature review authored by Pauline Slot (University of Utrecht). It examines how structural and process aspects of ECEC quality are interrelated in the provisions of ECEC for children from birth to age 5, including family daycare. The review has an explicit cross-national focus, and includes the “grey” literature (i.e. national and international reports, unpublished studies, recent evidence).

To complement the literature review, a meta-analysis was authored by Antje von Suchodoletz (New York University Abu Dhabi), D. Susie Lee, Bharathy Premachandra and Hirokazu Yoshikawa (New York University). It explores how aspects of quality are associated with child development and learning. The meta-analysis also has an explicit cross-national focus, but was limited to centre-based settings for children aged 3 to 5. Both background studies were designed, implemented and concluded in 2017.
Based on the two research studies (literature review and meta-analysis), this report was written by the OECD ECEC team: Clara Barata (lead author), with contributions from Victoria Liberatore (e.g. introductions, OECD data charts, research assistance), Arno Engel and Miho Taguma (e.g. messaging, Chapters 1 and 5). Project support was provided by Mernie Graziotin. Guillaume Bousquet finalised the meta-analysis charts with guidance from Éric Charbonnier. Victoria Elliott provided the editorial support. Sophie Limoges and Rachel Linden provided support to the publication process.

Members of the OECD Network on Early Childhood Education and Care provided feedback on draft versions of the report, and helped guide the development of the research and publication (see Annex A).

Co-ordination was initially provided by Éric Charbonnier, and later Clara Barata, with overall guidance and support by Yuri Belfali, Miho Taguma and Arno Engel. Final review was provided by Andreas Schleicher, Noémie Le Donné, Elizabeth Shuey and Hannah Ulferts. The report also benefitted from conceptual discussions on process quality with the Questionnaire Expert Group and Consortium of the OECD Starting Strong Teaching and Learning International Survey.

This document has been co-funded by the European Union. The opinions expressed and arguments employed herein do not necessarily reflect the official views of the European Union, OECD member countries or OECD ECEC Network members. This work has also been produced with the financial support of the Jacobs Foundation Switzerland.

**Table of contents**

Foreword ................................................................................................................................... 3

List of abbreviations ................................................................................................................ 9

Executive summary ................................................................................................................ 11

Chapter 1. Overview: Promoting quality early childhood education and care, child development and learning ..................................................................................................... 13

Introduction ........................................................................................................................... 14

Scope and evidence base of this report ................................................................................. 17

Most OECD countries now offer universal access to at least a year of early childhood education and care, but its quality remains a concern .......................................................... 19

The importance and definition of quality .............................................................................. 22

Linking research to policy levers for improving early childhood education and care quality ............................................................................................................................ 29

Annex 1.A. Variation in Early Childhood Education and Care staff-child interactions across studies and age ranges ................................................................................................ 31

Notes ..................................................................................................................................... 33

References ............................................................................................................................. 33

Chapter 2. Standards and governance for quality early childhood education and care. 41

Introduction ........................................................................................................................... 42

What does research tell us about the importance of quality standards and governance for quality staff-child interactions in early childhood education and care? .......................... 44

Note ....................................................................................................................................... 58

References ............................................................................................................................. 58

Chapter 3. Supporting quality early childhood education and care through workforce development and working conditions ................................................................................................ 65

Introduction ........................................................................................................................... 66

What does the research tell us about the importance of workforce development and working conditions for staff-child interactions in early childhood education and care? ...... 68

Notes ..................................................................................................................................... 87

References ............................................................................................................................. 87

Chapter 4. Data and monitoring to improve quality in early childhood education and care ................................................................................................................................. 95

Introduction ........................................................................................................................... 96
What does research tell us about the importance of data and monitoring for staff-child interactions in early childhood education and care? ............................................................. 98
References ........................................................................................................................... 102

Chapter 5. Key insights and avenues for further research ................................. 105

Introduction ......................................................................................................................... 106
Avenues for further research 1: clarifying inconclusive evidence ......................... 112
Avenues for further research 2: create new evidence where gaps exist or where research hypotheses are not applicable ................................................................. 114
Note ..................................................................................................................................... 115
References ........................................................................................................................... 127

Annex A. List of network member contributors ....................................................... 135

Annex B. Literature review method ............................................................... 137

Reference ............................................................................................................................ 138

Annex C. Meta-analysis method ............................................................... 139

References ........................................................................................................................... 157

Tables

Table 1.1. Influence of structural characteristics on staff-child interactions and child development and learning for well-documented policy levers ........................................ 17
Table 1.2. Structural and process indicators examined in this report for each policy theme ......................................................... 30
Table 2.1. Diversity in child-staff ratios and group sizes in reported studies for centres for children aged 3 to 5 ................................................................. 45
Table 2.2. Diversity in child-staff ratios and group sizes in reported studies for centres for children aged 0 to 2 ................................................................. 51
Table 2.3. Diversity in child-staff ratios and group sizes in reported studies for family daycare settings ......................................................................................... 52
Table 5.1. A summary of findings from the literature review of the relationship between structural characteristics and staff-child interactions ........................................ 117
Table 5.2. A summary of findings from the meta-analysis of the relationship between structural characteristics, staff-child interactions, and child development and learning for centres for children aged 3 to 5 ......................................................... 123
Figures

Figure 1.1. Proportion of low performers among 15-year-old pupils according to the numbers of years spent in early childhood education (PISA 2015) ......................... 15
Figure 1.2. Enrolment rates in early childhood education and primary education, by age (2014) .................................................................................................................. 20
Figure 1.3. Percentage of 15-year-old students who attended early childhood education (ISCED 0) for two years and more, by socio-economic background (PISA 2015)....... 21
Figure 1.4. Conceptual and analytical model for the relationship between ECEC structural quality, process quality, and child development and learning ........................................... 26
Figure 2.1. Child-staff ratios in early childhood education and care (ISCED 0) (2015). 42
Figure 2.2. Lower child-staff ratios are associated with positive staff-child interactions. ...... 47
Figure 2.3. No consistent evidence of association between child-staff ratios and emerging academic skills .................................................................................................................. 49
Figure 2.4. Mixed associations between intensity of daily service and staff-child interactions. .............................................................................................................................. 55
Figure 3.1. Annual statutory teachers’ salaries in pre-primary education (2015) .......... 67
Figure 3.2. More positive staff-child interactions are associated with higher levels of child emerging academic skills.......................................................... 69
Figure 3.3. Inconsistent associations between positive staff-child relationships and child behavioural/social skills ........................................................................................................ 71
Figure 3.4. Negative staff-child interactions are associated with worse behavioural/social skills .......................................................................................................................... 72
Figure 3.5. Higher quality or exposure to developmental and educational activities is associated with higher levels of children’s skills........................................................ 73
Figure 3.6. Higher levels of pre-service qualifications are associated with higher quality of staff-child interactions. .................................................................................. 74
Figure 3.7. No association between pre-service qualifications and provision of development and educational activities. ................................................................. 75
Figure 3.8. No evidence of consistent association between pre-service qualifications and children’s development and learning ........................................... 77
Figure 3.9. Inconsistent associations between work experience and staff-child interactions. 82
Figure 3.10. No evidence of association between staff work experience and provision of development and educational activities ................................................................. 83

Boxes

Box 1.1. Commonly used measures to assess ECEC process quality. 25
Box 2.1. Interpreting the meta-analysis charts. 48
Box 2.2. Interpreting the meta-analysis charts. 48
Box 3.1. Organisation of networking in family daycare settings ......................................... 86
Box 4.1. Quality rating and improvement systems in the United States. 97
Please cite this chapter as:


DOI: https://doi.org/10.1787/9789264085145-1-en