

# Foreword

Rapid digital developments pose a challenge to governments seeking to use new technologies and data to provide more effective services to citizens and businesses. The OECD Digital Government Review assesses the opportunities and challenges linked to Panama's digital agenda.

In recent years, the Government of Panama has invested in the digitalisation of the public sector for improved efficiency and responsiveness. It has laid the foundations for successful digital government by improving the operational effectiveness of the National Authority for Government Innovation (*Autoridad Nacional para la Innovación Gubernamental, AIG*). Panama should now focus on developing expertise and shared capabilities throughout the public sector. This review suggests a number of actions to support Panama's efforts to improve social well-being and suitable economic growth. These include measures to enhance the strategic use of digital tools and data to create a competitive, inclusive and cohesive economic environment; support productivity; and foster citizens' and business' trust in government institutions.

This review was prepared at the request of the Republic of Panama. The importance of this policy area for the government is demonstrated by Panama's voluntary adherence to the *OECD Recommendation of the Council on Digital Government Strategies* in 2017. The review builds upon the analytical framework provided by the Recommendation and on the experience of the OECD developed through similar projects over the last 15 years. The review also brought together experts and policy practitioners from several countries to provide peer insights.

This review and Panama's experiences also contribute to the global policy debate on the digitalisation challenges and opportunities across different policy areas, including digital government. This work is part of the Going Digital Project, which is the OECD flagship initiative designed to address this policy issue.



# Acknowledgements

The *Digital Government Review of Panama* was prepared by the OECD Directorate for Public Governance (GOV), under the leadership of Marcos Bonturi.

The review was produced by the OECD Reform of Public Sector Division (GOV/RPS), under the supervision of Barbara-Chiara Ubaldi, Deputy Head of Division and Head of the Digital Transformation of the Public Sector work.

Chapters 1 and 2 were written by João Ricardo Vasconcelos, Digital Government Policy Analyst in the Public Sector Reform Division. Chapters 3 and 4 were written by Benjamin Welby, Digital Government Policy Analyst in the Public Sector Reform Division. All chapters benefitted from the strategic orientation and revisions of Barbara-Chiara Ubaldi. João Ricardo Vasconcelos served as the lead co-ordinator of the review. Eleonore Morena edited the manuscript. Alison Rygh, Liv Gaunt and Raquel Páramo prepared the document for publication and provided editorial and administrative support.

This project would not have been possible without the support of the National Authority for Government Innovation (AIG) in Panama and the valuable support and knowledge provided by the following public officials from OECD countries who acted as peers during the OECD peer review mission to Panama City in November, 2018:

- Mr. Frank Leyman, Manager International Relations, Federal Public Service Policy and Support (BOSA), Belgium;
- Ms. Kareen Schramm López, Coordinator of Policies and Studies, Division of Digital Government, Ministry General Secretariat of the Presidency, Chile;
- Ms. Cristina Pilar Ramos Miguel, Technical advisor, General Secretariat of Digital Administration, Ministry of Territorial Policy and Public Function, Spain.

The OECD Secretariat would like to acknowledge the contribution of all public officials in Panama who participated in the OECD survey and provided their comments. The OECD Secretariat especially thanks José Gabriel Carrizo Jaén, Vice President of Panama; Luis Oliva, Asesor de la Autoridad Nacional para la Innovación Gubernamental (AIG); Luis Carlos Stoute, Sub Administrator (AIG); Irvin Halman, Ex-Administrator

The Secretariat is also grateful to the experts from civil society, the private sector, academia and other communities that participated in the seminars and events organised in the context of this review and the OECD follow-up missions to Panama, including: Verónica Zavala Lombardi, Manager of the Department of Central American Countries, Haiti, Mexico, Panama, and the Dominican Republic of the Inter-American Development Bank; Gaspar García De Paredes, Director General of the National Competitiveness Center; Julio Escobar, Advisory Commission of the National Authority for Government Innovation; Miguel Angel Esbrí, Executive Secretary of the Secretariat of Competitiveness and Logistics of the Presidency; Carlos Barsallo, President of the Foundation for the Development of Citizen Liberty.

The Secretariat would also like to recognise the role of the following entities for the development of the current Review: Tocumen International Airport; Panamanian Association of Law and New Technologies;

Micro Authority; Small and Medium Business; Public Services Authority; Authority for Consumer Protection and Defense of Competition; Transit Authority and Land Transportation; Panama Canal Authority; Maritime Authority of Panama; National Customs Authority; National Land Authority; National Authority of Transparency and Access to Information; Panamanian Passport Authority; Savings Bank; Social Security Fund; Panamanian Chamber of Information Technologies, Innovation and Telecommunications; National Center of Competitiveness; Office of the Comptroller General of the Republic; Electric Transmission Company; Attorney General's Office; Foundation for the Development of Citizen Liberty; Logistic Cabinet; Institute of Agricultural Marketing; National Institute of Culture; National Institute of Professional Training and Training for Human Development; National Institute of Women; Institute for the Formation and Use of the Human Resource; Metro of Panama; Ministry of Environment; Ministry of Commerce and Industry; Ministry of Agricultural Development; Ministry of Social Development; Ministry of Economy and Finance; Ministry of Education; Ministry of Health; Ministry of Security; Ministry of Labour and Labour Development; Municipality of Panama; Judicial Authority; Office of the Attorney General of the Nation; Public Registry; National Secretary of Energy; National Secretariat of Science, Technology and Innovation; National Secretariat for Decentralization; National Secretariat for Disability; National Secretariat for Children, Adolescents and the Family; National Migration Service; National Civil Protection Service; System of Savings and Capitalization of Pensions of the Public Servants; Superintendency of Banks; Superintendence of Insurance; Massive transport; Tax Administrative Court; Electoral Tribunal; International Maritime University of Panama; Technology University of Panama.

# Table of contents

Foreword	3
Acknowledgements	5
Executive summary	11
<b>Assessments and Recommendations</b>	<b>15</b>
Strengthening governance	15
Building institutional capacities	19
Data-driven public sector	23
Service design and delivery	27
References	33
<b>1 Strengthening governance</b>	<b>35</b>
Introduction	36
Driving the digital transformation of the public sector	37
Leadership for sound transformation	44
Co-ordination, compliance and mandates	50
Enabling legislation and digital rights	54
References	59
Notes	61
<b>2 Enhancing the digital transformation of the public sector</b>	<b>63</b>
Introduction	64
Digital culture and skills in the public sector	64
Planning of investments in digital technologies	71
Towards digital commissioning	80
References	87
<b>3 Data driven public sector</b>	<b>89</b>
Introduction	90
Data governance in Panama	92
Applying data to unlock public value	104
Data for trust	110
References	115
<b>4 Service design and delivery</b>	<b>119</b>
Introduction	120

Culture for service design and delivery in Panama	121
Providing the resources and enablers that support delivery and adoption	125
References	142

## Tables

Table 1.1. Main demands of the stakeholders for the Digital Strategy 2014-19	42
Table 1.2. The vision and functions of AIG	46
Table 1.3. Examples of key digital government legislation in Panama	55

## Figures

Figure 1.1. Governing the digital transformation of the public sector: Dimensions of analysis	36
Figure 1.2. Existence of a national digital government strategy in OECD countries in the Latin America and Caribbean (LAC) region	38
Figure 1.3. PANAMA 4.0: Strategic lines and values	39
Figure 1.4. Recognition of the existence of a digital government strategy among Panamanian public sector organisations	41
Figure 1.5. Relevance of the digital government strategy for Panamanian public sector organisations	42
Figure 1.6. Co-ordinated development of the digital government strategy/policy with Panamanian public sector organisations	43
Figure 1.7. Existence of a digital government co-ordinating public sector organisation in OECD countries in the LAC region	44
Figure 1.8. Recognition of the existence of a co-ordinating body responsible for Panama's digital government policy	47
Figure 1.9. Main responsibilities attributed to the co-ordinating body responsible for Panama's digital government policy	48
Figure 1.10. Regular co-ordination with the co-ordinating body responsible for Panama's digital government policy	51
Figure 1.11. Purposes of regular co-ordination with the body responsible for Panama's digital government policy	53
Figure 1.12. Institutionalising the digital transformation	54
Figure 1.13. Perceptions of the legal and regulatory framework in Panama	56
Figure 1.14. Digital rights – Towards a citizen-driven transformation	58
Figure 2.1. Six core skills for public sector innovation	65
Figure 2.2. Types of digital skills required by civil servants in the context of a digital transformation of the public sector	66
Figure 2.3. Level of priority and acknowledgement of digital skills policy in the Panamanian public sector	67
Figure 2.4. Digital skills strategies in Panamanian public sector organisations	68
Figure 2.5. Digital skills – Supply and demand policy approaches	70
Figure 2.6. Policy levers for sound implementation	72
Figure 2.7. ICT budget threshold – Knowledge about its existence in Panamanian public sector organisations	74
Figure 2.8. ICT financial benefits – Measurement in the central government (LAC)	75
Figure 2.9. ICT costs and benefits – Estimation in Panamanian public sector organisations	75
Figure 2.10. A framework for ICT business cases	76
Figure 2.11. ICT business cases – Use by Panamanian public sector organisations	77
Figure 2.12. ICT procurement – Different outcomes	81
Figure 2.13. Existence of an ICT procurement strategy in LAC countries	82
Figure 2.14. ICT procurement – Methods used by Panamanian public sector organisations	83
Figure 2.15. Agile commissioning	84
Figure 2.16. ICT commissioning – Draft of principles	86
Figure 3.1. Opportunities of a DDPS	91
Figure 3.2. Data governance in the public sector	91
Figure 3.3. National and institutional data strategies in Panama	93
Figure 3.4. The biggest barriers to the use of data within institutions	95

Figure 3.5. Does your institution have a strategy/initiative to develop or enhance in-house data-related literacy and skills among public officials?	96
Figure 3.6. Government Data Value Cycle	99
Figure 3.7. Measures for ensuring the quality of data	101
Figure 3.8. How data is accessed from other public institutions	102
Figure 3.9. How data is shared with other public institutions	103
Figure 3.10. Objectives contained within institutional data strategies	105
Figure 3.11. Has your institution implemented policy initiatives to analyse data in these ways?	107
Figure 3.12. How far institutional leadership acknowledges the potential and value of open data	108
Figure 3.13. Priority of data protection and privacy in Panama's digital government agenda	112
Figure 3.14. Extent to which citizens or businesses are able to view how their data is used	112
Figure 3.15. Institutional appetite for support with data ethics	114
Figure 4.1. Foundations for transformed service design and delivery	120
Figure 4.2. The World Economic Forum Global Competitiveness Index 4.0	122
Figure 4.3. AIG provided applications and platforms	123
Figure 4.4. Extent to which institutions have formal policies for consultation and feedback, co-creation and co-delivery, or evaluation of public service delivery	124
Figure 4.5. Priority of digital inclusion in Panama's digital government agenda	127
Figure 4.6. The existence of centrally produced written guidelines for accessibility and engagement in Panama	128
Figure 4.7. Inclusion of institutional digital services within <i>PanamáTramita</i>	129
Figure 4.8. The relative importance of different channels in accessing services in Panama	130
Figure 4.9. Approach to designing, building and maintaining online services	132
Figure 4.10. Institutional approaches to DI in Panama	134
Figure 4.11. Public sector innovation facets	137

## Boxes

Box 1.1. PANAMA 4.0 – Model for reporting and project implementation	40
Box 1.2. Digital government leadership - Examples from Portugal and the United Kingdom	49
Box 1.3. Cross-level co-ordination – Examples from Brazil and Norway	51
Box 1.4. Public guide for legislators on the integration of digital technologies (Austria)	57
Box 2.1. Digital, Data and Technology Profession Capability Framework and GDS Academy in the United Kingdom	69
Box 2.2. Project management standards – The experiences of Brazil and Norway	79
Box 2.3. Governing the investment in digital technologies in the Portuguese public sector	80
Box 3.1. <i>OECD Recommendation of the Council on Digital Government Strategies</i> : Principle 3	90
Box 3.2. Guidance published and curated by central digital authorities to support teams elsewhere in government	98
Box 3.3. Platforms in Panama that support data sharing	100
Box 3.4. Basic Data in Denmark	102
Box 3.5. How analysis of data and having an interoperability platform helped a Portuguese service reach an extra 600 000 people	106
Box 3.6. Measuring the performance of digital government services in the United Kingdom	109
Box 3.7. <i>Carpeta Ciudadana</i>	113
Box 4.1. Decree on Simplification of Procedures	122
Box 4.2. The United Kingdom's Service Toolkit	126
Box 4.3. Thematic Group on the Design and Delivery of Services	131
Box 4.4. DI in Italy and New Zealand	133
Box 4.5. Public sector innovation facets	137
Box 4.6. Panama Digital Hub	139
Box 4.7. Cross-border recognition of credentials	141







**From:**  
**Digital Government Review of Panama**  
Enhancing the Digital Transformation of the Public Sector

**Access the complete publication at:**  
<https://doi.org/10.1787/615a4180-en>

**Please cite this chapter as:**

OECD (2019), "Foreword", in *Digital Government Review of Panama: Enhancing the Digital Transformation of the Public Sector*, OECD Publishing, Paris.

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1787/7f67ff5c-en>

This work is published under the responsibility of the Secretary-General of the OECD. The opinions expressed and arguments employed herein do not necessarily reflect the official views of OECD member countries.

This document and any map included herein are without prejudice to the status of or sovereignty over any territory, to the delimitation of international frontiers and boundaries and to the name of any territory, city or area.

You can copy, download or print OECD content for your own use, and you can include excerpts from OECD publications, databases and multimedia products in your own documents, presentations, blogs, websites and teaching materials, provided that suitable acknowledgment of OECD as source and copyright owner is given. All requests for public or commercial use and translation rights should be submitted to [rights@oecd.org](mailto:rights@oecd.org). Requests for permission to photocopy portions of this material for public or commercial use shall be addressed directly to the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) at [info@copyright.com](mailto:info@copyright.com) or the Centre français d'exploitation du droit de copie (CFC) at [contact@cfcopies.com](mailto:contact@cfcopies.com).